

A review of youth music and music education in Bristol

January 2017



Commissioned by



**Bristol
Music
Trust**

Putting music at the heart of Bristol life

Contents

01

Foreword

02

Summary and directions for the future

03

Introduction

04

Music and Bristol

05

Strategic review

06

Context

07

Organisations in Bristol

08

Bristol Plays Music – the role of the hub

08.1 Core roles

08.2 Extension roles

09

Areas of activity, interest and operation

09.1 Performance

09.2 Genres

09.3 Singing

09.4 Early years

09.5 In schools

09.6 Post 18

09.7 Ensembles

10

Inclusion, needs and diversity

10.1 Additional, special educational needs and disabilities

10.2 Inclusion

10.3 Diversity

10.4 Direction overall

11

Young musicians

11.1 Youth voice, musical minds

11.2 Coaching and experience with professionals

11.3 Music business and career employment

11.4 Accreditation

12

Providers and other issues

12.1 Research

12.2 Pathways

12.3 Information and communication

12.4 Relationships, partnerships, consortia

12.5 Networking

12.6 The workforce

12.7 Training in higher education

12.8 CPD, training, workforce development

12.9 Geography, travel, transport

12.10 Resources

12.11 Finance, fundraising

12.12 Venues, promoters

12.13 Exporting Bristol's knowledge and skills

13

In conclusion

I am delighted to be able to commend this Review of Youth Music and Music Education, which amply demonstrates the important role music plays in our city. Music is part of the city's cultural and economic success and central to its future. Indeed, Bristol's ongoing commitment to music education has recently been recognised nationally by the award of the Music Education Council Major Prize. Bristol prides itself on ensuring access to a high quality music education is available for all children and young people, and we are also mindful that this means utilising both formal and informal pathways and celebrating a wide range of music genres, styles and performance models. Music is the most democratic of cultural forms, and the most communal. It brings communities together, gives them purpose and shared goals. It can help to instil self-discipline, encourage ambition, drive aspiration and reward achievement.

This Review will help to cement Bristol's reputation as England's most musical city – a reputation which we are confident will continue for many years to come.

Cllr Estella Tincknell

Cabinet Member for Culture, Events and Equalities
Bristol City Council

This review and its directions for the future are presented as a broad overview after a lengthy process of consultation – a picture of the diverse activities, interests and needs of the young musicians of Bristol and the scope and variety of those who serve them.

It is produced for and shared with all of Bristol as a positive, unified approach to youth music and music education and the most effective ways of working in a city that is already achieving a great deal.

Set in the context of the establishment of the government funded Music Hub system – with the obligatory core and extension roles that Bristol Plays Music already achieves and extends even further – and in the current environment of change, competing standards of assessment and financial constraint, the review deals with a range of musical and non-musical but contingent issues.

The review celebrates the strength and breadth of the Bristol music scene, the enthusiasm and talent of its young musicians and the extensive range of provision of support for them from a highly committed network of organisations from both the independent and public sectors.

Whilst confirming considerable appreciation for the work of the present, the review identifies areas and issues that will benefit from increased work and development and provides advocacy and encouragement for all of the city's music leaders to continue, build and extend the opportunities they offer to every young Bristolian.

The principle behind the review and its recommended actions – set out as Directions for the Future as summarised below – is that it sees the provision and activity in music from the perspective of the city's children and young people, their needs and interests.

The review is made at a point in time and its ideas and recommendations should not be static but should be revised and updated as the work progresses.

Nod Knowles, NKP

The document concludes with two overriding imperatives:

Bristol will focus on supporting all its young musicians in whatever ways they wish and in whatever parts of their musical journey.

Bristol's organisations and music leaders will form strong partnerships, with those who are most able taking their fair share of responsibility – and will commit to forging effective, co-ordinated responses to support music education across the full spectrum of the city's schools and communities.

The Role Of The Hub

- Continue to explain and illustrate the roles and responsibilities of Bristol Plays Music as a Music Education Hub to the wider education and public sector.

Performance

- Continue to build and publicise opportunities for musical performances by and for young musicians with venues and festivals across the city.

Genres

- Continue to build programmes in which musicians from different spheres can explore each others' music and experiment in playing together.
- Seek further contact with other youth arts providers to explore potential collaborative opportunities for inter-disciplinary work.

Singing

- Continue to develop the widest range of singing opportunities and partnership links with adult choirs and other providers.

Early Years

- Look to connect Early Years providers in a network that feeds into primary school access.

In Schools

- Make every effort to regularly review and update school music plans.
- Encourage schools to explore the range of external opportunities for their pupils.
- Consider the development of a long-term music log for young musicians.

Post 18

- Incorporate 18 to 25s in the work on pathways and referral information.

Ensembles

- Support and nurture large and small ensembles of all (and mixed) genres.

Inclusion, needs, diversity

- Ensure that environments and ways of working are founded upon principles that will allow fully inclusive provision for all young musicians.

Additional and special educational needs and disabilities

- Prioritise the pursuit of 'Inclusive Excellence' through leadership by A New Ambition for Inclusive Excellence and its partners.
- Seek equal and permanent sustainable status for inclusive music-making by pursuing designation for Bristol as a DfE funded Centre of Advanced Training for musicians for special educational needs and disabilities.
- Address the needs of this practice in workforce development, physical access and musical equipment.

Inclusion

- Undertake consistent research into the demographics of inclusion and disengagement in order to identify other groups who could benefit from access to music-making.
- Emphasise inclusive practice in workforce development through CPD and training for complementary skills.

Diversity

- Encourage and develop diversity in the workforce.
- Continue to seek understanding of cultural attitudes and their relation to music and music-making environments.

Young musicians, youth voice, musical minds

- As a first principle, place the young musician at the centre of the work.
- Incorporate a youth-centred perspective in all staff induction.
- Ensure that a youth-centred perspective is a clear part of the organisation's values.
- Factor capacity and resource for youth-centred, youth-led activity into budgets and fundraising.
- Ensure the voices of young people are heard from across the full range of music and musicians and responded to appropriately.
- Enable existing youth networks across the city to connect with one another.

Coaching and experience with professionals

- Continue to support and encourage highest level of interaction between young musicians and their professional coaches and mentors.

Music business, career, employment

- Continue to develop relationships with the music industry for guidance and work experience opportunities.
- Encourage and increase links with further and higher education.

- Assist the families of young musicians to understand the scope and potential of a career in music.

Research

- Prioritise research into issues of diversity and inclusion. Collaborate to build consistently comparable and practically useful data.
- Continue action research into the interests and progression of young musicians.
- Consider the engagement or appointment of a researcher(s) to conduct ongoing research and identify areas of work and communities to approach with new opportunities.

Pathways

- Accumulate and map comprehensive information on a range of appropriate pathways and referrals.
- Seek to address whatever gaps may be apparent in those pathways, including routes into the industry.

Information and communication

- Differentiate the areas of advocacy, trade information, directory and contact information and youth music networking information.
- Work together to find effective ways of collecting and disseminating information and communicating with the target groups, to avoid duplication of effort.

Relationships, partnerships, consortia

- Continue to develop consortia and collaborations for 3rd Space Music and A New Ambition For Inclusive Excellence.

- Encourage other possible groupings (for example Early Years?) to consider exploring the development of consortia that may add value to the sum of individual activities.

Networking

- Plan, shape and inaugurate a regular networking event to reach the widest groups of professional practitioners and organisations.

Workforce development, education, training, CPD

- Support and nurture the workforce and advocate the value and impact of their collective activity.
- Continue to broaden the scope of CPD and training to encompass musical and non-musical skills and inclusive practice.
- Follow a policy of broadening the diversity of the workforce.
- Learn from good examples of CPD as practised in other markedly diverse communities in the UK.

Geography, travel, Transport

- Explore options for overcoming the barriers to access for young musicians of travel and transport.

Resources

- Make allowances in operating and project budgets and fundraising for the acquisition and renewal of resources, instruments and equipment.

Finance, fundraising

- Advocate, where possible, for longer-term and more sustainable funding for ongoing programmes of work.

- Explore the potential or viability of a Bristol-wide, sustainable bursary or support fund.
- Explore opportunities for collective fundraising or income generation.
- Seek research and advocacy opportunities around the value of investment in youth music and music education in Bristol.
- Advocate for arts and music education in schools.

Venues, promoters

- Continue and encourage further engagement by promoters and venues with education and young musicians.
- Support and encourage Bristol Music Trust in their transformation to a state of the art facility and an organisation centred on music and young musicians.

Exporting Bristol's knowledge and skills

- Within the sector's network, and with other appropriate agencies for the development of skills and opportunities for Bristol, explore the idea of collaborative promotion of Bristol skills and provision further afield.

This document – the review and its directions for the future – is deliberately presented as a broad overview. It aims to give a picture of the diverse interests and needs of the young musicians of Bristol and to embrace the scope and variety of the organisations and individuals involved in serving them.

And because music is such an all-pervading element in the lives of individuals and the society in which they live, the review inevitably touches on issues far wider than just the concerns of how, what and where to play.

Although commissioned by Bristol Plays Music, the designated Music Education Hub for the city, this document is produced for and shared with all of Bristol, not just directed at the work of the Hub. It is a summary of what young musicians across the city and their music leaders and tutors are doing now and their ideas and aspirations for the activities that can continue to grow and flourish in future years.

It aims to be a positive statement, in response to the process of review and consultation, of a unified approach to youth music and music education, helping to focus on the most effective ways of working in the city - deploying skills, addressing gaps and supporting music making in all its aspects.

Music is an essential part of people's everyday lives. Since the invention of recording, then broadcasting and now the internet and digital transmission, it has been increasingly more possible – and more likely – for people to be immersed in and surrounded by music, accessing it as listeners whenever they want.

Participation in music – singing and playing – takes so many forms and it can start from – and go forward in – innumerable different directions. When young people begin to take an interest in music it is not the study of a remote or obscure subject – music is already there in their lives. And if they live in Bristol they already have a head start.

Bristol has always been a city full of music and music-makers. The city of Massive Attack, of Portishead; the city where Roni Size and Reprazent leapt from the Basement Studio to the Mercury Music Prize; the city where Andy Sheppard led the celebratory instrumentalists of Saxophone Massive; the city forever on the international tour schedules of great artists and orchestras, from Duke Ellington to the St Petersburg Philharmonic.

Bristol has a wealth of clubs and pubs and venues and of organisers willing to promote music in them – and an equally diverse proliferation of individuals and organisations dedicated to providing opportunities and support for the city's young people who are drawn to music-making for themselves.

The inauguration of the Bristol Music Trust and its re-development of the Colston Hall not only as a venue but a centre for music-making and the home-base of the Bristol Music Education Hub has provided a timely opportunity to set out future directions for music education and the support of young musicians. But the process does not start with a blank page – quite the reverse. It starts with an inspiring array of activity and activists already engaged in some of the most diverse and forward-looking aspects of participation and music education.

What follows is a summing up of a series of consultations undertaken in the past two years under the aegis of Bristol Plays Music. Some of the work has been done by the Bristol Plays Music team, some by other experts from experienced cultural and music organisations including the Real Ideas Organisation, Sound Connections and the University of Bristol – and finally by Nod Knowles of NKP, who drew together all the strands of consultation and drafted this document.

The consultations have been extensive and have explored the work and contributions of a wide range of young music-makers and an equally wide range of educators. This review covers these contributions but it is not an audit, nor simply a list of who does what. Some of the many organisations consulted are referenced or given as examples in the text but it is not the intention to name or detail the specific work of every one.

The review is strategic in that it concludes by outlining a number of broad directions and actions that work in youth music and music education can pursue in the future – with a view to supporting the Council’s initiative which will produce a document on ‘Bristol’s Cultural Future’.

The directions are a template for future activity built around the excellent work already being done across the city. They address some of the actions that will benefit young musicians and their music-making by filling gaps, making links, developing ideas and underpinning effective operation. Overall the message is one of appreciation for the work of the present and of encouragement to continue, build and extend.

Before the inauguration of the government's National Plan for Music and the establishment, in all 123 English local authorities, of a Music Education Hub, funded by DfE via Arts Council England, music tuition in Bristol was provided by a local authority music service. Providing peripatetic tutors and out-of-school activities and ensembles in music centres, the service was autonomous, complementing the work of class music teachers in the city's schools.

Outside of this formal education system a surprisingly wide range of organisations had established themselves as alternative non-formal sector providers of music instruction and participative opportunities in different styles – anything from the Basement Studios based around youth service provision to choir and masterclass programmes such as those offered by St George's.

There were links and liaisons between some of these various providers – but no established umbrella organisation to bring them together in more structured collaborations or networks.

The creation of the Music Education Hub system, initially imposed by the National Plan for Music, was predicated on a more joined-up approach between the formal and non-formal sectors and a more consistent approach across schools and tuition services. At the outset the Hub's role and obligations were not necessarily clear to those already working in music education – a common circumstance in most localities, not just Bristol.

Each Hub had to establish itself in the particular circumstances of its local authority – and in Bristol the unusually large range of non-formal sector organisations may have been

understandably anxious about the prospect of a funded, potentially centralised 'overseer' of their otherwise independent work. At the same time, there may also have been expectations of funding that could be drawn down from this new body.

In the relatively short lifetime of Bristol Plays Music, expectations and relationships with schools and the non-formal sector providers have now settled considerably. BPM has established its own structure and a sound business plan and put in motion – or joined in with – several initiatives in partnership with other providers. The ground is now far better prepared for further joined-up, unified approaches to youth music-making across the city.

The Hub and all other providers, however, are all affected by wider external circumstances. Cuts in public finances and in the availability of core and project funding present acute challenges to organisations of any size. Added to which, constant change in the requirements and priorities of public and governmental agencies prompts uncertainty in providers and necessitates constant shifts in their own direction and planning.

The formal school system, too, continues to change. The academy system – with its mix of sole-governing

schools and multi-academy clusters – and the autonomy of school planning (overlaid with requirements of assessment and measurement) means that liaison and coherent engagement in project work with schools can be complicated for independent non-formal providers – and even for the Hub.

Within the oversight of the Hub there are also differing requirements – those of DfE looking to measurable standards whilst Arts Council England, under DCMS, is more concerned with issues such as access, outreach and inclusivity.

Young people in Bristol are fortunate – there is a considerable number of organisations of various kinds offering opportunities to participate in music. Each functions differently, has different relationships or partnerships with others – and each organisation and project has differing objectives. Almost all are independent entities, with their own governance, management, finance and operational structure. Some have their own premises for activity – some share or are hosted by others or use available spaces as necessary.

There is a degree of strength and resilience in this broad pattern of independent providers – the overall potential for provision is far less vulnerable than if there were only one or two. As this review shows, the shared understandings and connections that they can continue to make between them will prove the value of their multiplicity.

The organisational names and project titles (of which there is a bewildering array) are not always indicative of what they do – and many (for example the Creative Youth Network, with its range of creative arts and youth service provision) have a brief wider than just music or music education. In addition, there are a number of national or regional organisations from further afield (for instance, Urban Development or the Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra) that have made connections or have a brief to work with Bristol.

Roles and activities of these providers and their projects, and their ways of engaging with young people in music, also differ widely but each can be characterised by at least one – and in the majority of cases by several – of these broad categories:

- Music as a pleasurable pursuit.
- First/introductory access to music-making.
- Music as a career.
- Music for social and personal engagement and development.
- Wellbeing and health.
- Individual tuition.
- Music in a specific genre.
- Music-making with disability or special needs.
- Instrumental training.
- Vocal training.
- Specific age groups.
- Ensemble playing and singing.
- Recording, performing and the music business.
- Music in multi-artform/multi-disciplinary activity.
- Performance venues and performance opportunities.
- Masterclasses and interaction with artist.

This list of provision – plus the provision covered by the Hub and Bristol's schools – suggests a fine range of opportunities for families or young people looking for musical experiences. The issues for them, however, are the issues that this review is charged with addressing: how they can access any of these opportunities; how they can decide and follow their own path from one to another; and how can the providers ensure that the web of opportunities they provide is sufficiently extensive, cohesive and well-honed in order to serve as many of Bristol's younger generation as want to be music-makers.

The overriding principle, therefore, for any future direction, is to look at music provision from the perspective of the city's children and young people, their needs and interests.

As a relatively new institution in England, the Music Education Hub takes different shapes in different localities – but may not always be understood by the wider music education sector nor, more certainly, by parents and their children.

Under its place in the structure set out in the National Plan for Music Education and its funding by Arts Council England, the Hub's roles and obligations are defined in two parts: 'core' and 'extension'. The work involved can be undertaken by the Hub itself or be a mix of direct provision and working in partnership to support provision by others.

08.1 Core roles

- Ensure that every child aged 5-18 has the opportunity to learn a musical instrument (other than voice) through whole-class ensemble teaching programmes for ideally a year (but for a minimum of a term) of weekly tuition on the same instrument.
- Provide opportunities to play in ensembles and to perform from an early stage.
- Ensure that clear progression routes are available and affordable to all young people.
- Develop a singing strategy to ensure that every pupil sings regularly and that choirs and other vocal ensembles are available in the area.

08.2 Extension roles

- Offer CPD to school staff, particularly in supporting schools to deliver music in the curriculum.
- Provide an instrument loan service, with discounts or free provision for those on low incomes.
- Provide access to large scale and / or high quality music experiences for pupils, working with professional musicians and / or venues. This may include undertaking work to publicise the opportunities available to schools, parents/carers and students.

Bristol Plays Music, unique among Hubs in its location in a major concert hall dedicated to music, has developed a business plan and a programme that not only covers the basis of these roles but extends them far wider. The spirit of the National Plan is just the starting point for the ambition to make Bristol a leader in musical participation and education, in tandem and in direct partnerships with the city's other providers.

Currently the Hub provides the core roles via the services of its music centres and peripatetic tutors, supports a singing strategy, choirs and instrumental ensembles, the instrument loan service, continuing professional development (CPD) for teachers and tutors and performance opportunities at Colston Hall and elsewhere. As comprehensive a service as any Hub, this programme is just the basis for further more extensive activity. This includes:

- Working with every one of the schools in Bristol to produce their own bespoke annual music plan.
- Developing (and fundraising for) the 'A New Ambition for Inclusive Excellence' programme working in depth with young people with special educational needs or disabilities, in partnership with other specialist providers.
- The 'Youth Voice' consultative project giving young musicians centre-stage in the determination of future planning.
- Producing the Curriculum for Music for teachers in Bristol's primary schools.
- Co-ordinating the 3rd Space Music consortium of independent providers of support to ambitious young musicians and songwriters outside the formal education system.
- Supporting the Preludes scheme of immersive whole school instrumental education in classical music in two Bristol schools (run by the Bristol Ensemble in the spirit of In Harmony/Sistema).
- Building structured networks for primary teachers and secondary school heads of music.
- Introducing the Minute of Listening – available for free to all primary schools – in partnership with the London-based national organisation Sound and Music.

Bristol Plays Music – the role of the hub

08

- Providing, via its umbilical link with the Bristol Music Trust and Colston Hall, a series of performance opportunities and the status of companies in residence for the Bristol Youth Orchestra and Youth Choir.
- Setting up resources, space and tuition in Creative Music Technology and other digital programmes.
- Delivering aspects of a wider cultural education agenda for Bristol schools.
- And training/CPD sessions open to all music leaders and educators.

Bristol Plays Music has established a full suite of necessary regulatory and safeguarding policies. It is structured as a subsidiary of Bristol Music Trust, supported by the Trust's management and administration and governed by the Trust board with a Bristol Plays Music advisory group as a sub-committee of the board.

Action

Continue to explain and illustrate the roles and responsibilities of Bristol Plays Music as a Music Education Hub to the wider education and public sector.

Areas of activity, interest and operation

09

From the perspective of children and young people, the web of opportunities presented by schools, the Hub and independent providers is best described by the experiences that they can find and the ways through which they encounter them.

09.1 Performance

The Hub-supported youth orchestras and choirs in schools and music centres find opportunities to perform via their schools and Colston Hall. St George's similarly complements its education programme – for example with the Cosmos Choir and with school choirs – with performances. The Bristol Jazz and Blues Festival gives programme slots for young jazz groups, including the Hub-supported Youth Jazz Orchestra.

Structured tuition programmes such as Knowle West Music Centre's XLR course actively seek gigging opportunities for their members: and they join with others in the 3rd Space Music group to collectively provide showcase stages (at events like the Harbourside Festival and Balloon Fiesta) for young artists, indie bands and DJs.

The Sounds Inspiring Festival, drawing together performances in all aspects of youth music, has been a cross-Bristol event for two years and has been enthusiastically received, not only celebrating the young musicians but providing the added benefits of advocacy for youth music and the confirmation of collaborative efforts amongst provider organisations.

Action

Continue to build and publicise opportunities for musical performances by and for young musicians with venues and festivals across the city.

09.2 Genres

However eclectic and exploratory young listeners and musicians are – and however blurred and intermingled musical genres have become – there are still some broad categories within which much of music education takes place. For example: the Preludes immersive project takes classical music as its initial standpoint; whereas the 3rd Space Music organisations such as Trinity, the Basement Studio or ACE (Aspiration, Creation, Elevation) CIC focus on a range of music from indie bands to hip-hop and rap.

The Young Composers Academy in partnership with New Music South West concentrates on new music and composition in the contemporary classical tradition – and work with Sound And Music also focuses on similar skills; South West Music School offers a mix of styles; the Urban Artist Summer School offers a range of urban music styles; and jazz workshops and jazz orchestras do just what they say on the tin.

The area of traditional and folk music is of growing interest for young musicians across the UK but provision is not strong in Bristol. Bristol Plays Music has begun to work in partnership with the English Folk Dance and Song Society to develop work in folk music, including with a new national folk ensemble.

Singing sessions and choirs take less obvious account of genres but within specific instrumental and ensemble music (whether with small bands or large orchestras) there are relatively few opportunities for young musicians to explore and experience other musical fields.

Interest in a specific musical genre or style should not be hindered or inhibited – but there are obvious benefits in offering young people the freedom to find out about others if they wish.

The Remix Orchestra Ensemble, for all comers, all genres and all instruments – which featured as part of Colston Hall's previous education programme – was one such opportunity and has in part been superseded by the South Bristol Music Centre's 'Modern Orchestra' – but there is room for more cross-fertilisation in musical styles for young generation players.

The integration of music with other disciplines – such as drama, as in youth theatre work by Bristol Old Vic – has not been a focus of this review but there are considerable opportunities for development with other performing art organisations in the city as partners.

Areas of activity, interest and operation

09

Bristol Plays Music embraces dance in its important inter-relationship with music and has hosted the Stages festival for young dancers at the Colston Hall – and also runs the Kinesis youth dance group.

Programmes focusing on the music business, especially by culturally broadly-based organisations like Knowle West Media Centre and Creative Youth Network, feature elements of film and video making. In general, however, there is scope for more cross-disciplinary experiences to be offered.

Actions

Continue to build programmes in which musicians from different spheres can explore each others' music and experiment in playing together.

Seek further contact with other youth arts providers to explore potential collaborative opportunities for inter-disciplinary work.

09.3 Singing

The range and extent of activity amongst singers in Bristol – across all ages – appears to grow constantly. The city's adult choirs – of which there is a profusion – are constantly refreshed by recruiting young singers, more and more of whom have participated in school sessions and choirs – and learned the pleasure of singing – via the Hub's activities, nationally funded singing programmes and the past and present work of independent organisations such as Gathering Voices. The latter's year-round specialities include, amongst other interests, a cappella work in new and world/roots music and the city-wide Festival of Song.

Choirs proliferate in schools (38 schools participated in the 2016 summer concerts at the Colston Hall), in out-of-school groups such as the Hub's MiniSingers or Cosmos Choir as supported by St George's, and in churches and many other community groups.

There are various age groupings in youth choirs – but links to adult choirs provide a welcome pathway for young singers. The City of Bristol Choir and Bristol Youth Choir, for instance, have shared performances. Bristol Choral Society's apprentice scheme offers opportunities for aspiring young singers and Bristol Plays Music has made links with the Society through that scheme and through the 'Ahoy' project in which over 350 Bristol children were able to sing and perform.

Choirs and singing cover an unusually wide range of experiences and repertoire. For example, the SouthSide Choir, like the city's own Gurt Lush open access choir, covers a range of popular music. The Hub can offer opportunities to collaborate on creating an opera (in partnership with Iford Opera) or on the Monteverdi anniversary with the Monteverdi Choir. For Key Stage 1 children, annual singing days enable groups of schools to focus on immersive opportunities for pupils to sing and hear one another.

CPD and training for teachers or choir conductors takes various forms. The Vocal Leadership course, for example, is aimed at building the vocal and choral teaching skills of music co-ordinators, whilst specialist professors from the Royal Academy of Music will run an advanced choral conducting course for Bristol teachers.

Action

Continue to develop the widest range of singing opportunities for young people and partnership links with adult choirs and other providers.

09.4 Early years

Although the framework for the Music Education Hubs is for school ages from 5 to 19, initial experiences in music for children in their early years can be an important foundation for later access.

The Preludes programme begins in primary reception classes and the Curriculum for Music also begins at that point – can there be any extension of these initiatives to reach earlier years?

St George's host MiniBeats sessions for under fives and also takes them into schools for the younger primary classes. The Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra is developing an early years programme but has not yet extended it to Bristol. In general, this review has not encountered a great deal of early years activity but it is an area that should be of greater interest in the future.

Action

Look to connect Early Years providers in a network that feeds into primary school access.

Areas of activity, interest and operation

09

09.5 In Schools

With timetables full to bursting and the complex variations of organisation and budgets under the academy system, the work of liaising with and providing musical opportunities for school pupils is difficult, even for the Hub. The individual school music education plans, however, have been able to begin to tabulate the number and mix of pupils, their needs, demographics and set an outline of action for their work in music.

These plans can also help refer teachers to other provision that may be appropriate for their pupils, including the Hub's 'menu' of activities and the opportunities afforded by, for example, 'A New Ambition for Inclusive Excellence' programme or the Creative Youth Network. The issue of concern is whether the Hub has sufficient time and resource to be able to work with schools on annual updates of the plans.

School pupils have access to and insights into another range of musical activities when organisations outside the formal education sector have the ability to be hosted or contracted by their school. As a few examples: Knowle West Media Centre has run 'taster' sessions in local schools to demonstrate the attractions of the XLR course; Bristol Jazz and Blues Festival have piloted swing band performances in schools; St George's and others offer contact with visiting artists and the MiniBeats series; Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra musicians can work with exam and grade pupils, as can the Young Composers Academy partners.

The Bristol Ensemble's leadership of the Preludes programme – of immersive music education for entire years – is the first experiment of its kind in Bristol and one of the few such

El Sistema-like programmes in the UK. The initial detailed evaluation of the project demonstrates it promoting well-being, confidence and interest and increased engagement with schools and learning. The programme is inevitably expensive and would need to rely on sustainable financing to be able to carry on for several years in order to maximise its value and derive in-depth, long term evaluation and results.

Within schools pupils have a handbook – a record of their activity and progress, helping them and teachers to keep track of the work they have undertaken. Would a wider record of an individual's musical activity, in and out of school – a diary or log of all their musical experiences – be of use to them or their mentors in projecting other potential pathways and opportunities elsewhere?

Actions

Make every effort to regularly review and update school music plans.

Consider the development of a long-term music log for young musicians.

Encourage schools to explore the range of external opportunities for their pupils.

09.6 Post 18

The majority of organisations in the non-formal sector do not put rigid age limits on their participants – but people in the 18-25 age group are moving out of school and towards the upper limits of the general perception of 'youth'. Some move on to further or higher education – to conservatoire,

university or commercial music courses such as those run in Bristol by BIMM, Access To Music or Dbs. For those not wanting to pursue formal education or a career in music (and also perhaps those who want to but are not yet ready or able to do so) the opportunities are less evident.

Trinity and other non-formal organisations can accommodate them on some of their programmes but the transition out of 'youth' into adulthood has only ad hoc pathways.

Action

Incorporate 18 to 25s in the work on pathways and referral information.

09.7 Ensembles

Children and young people have access to a range of ensembles and choirs, rehearsing after school and weekends, at the city's music centres, co-ordinated by Bristol Plays Music in Southmead, Henbury, Withywood and (for choirs) Cotham. According to their current level of ability, musical interest and age group the choice is wide – from wind bands and concert orchestras to jazz bands and percussion groups.

Younger children have access to the Cosmos Choir – a longstanding project run by St George's in liaison with schools in the south of Bristol – or the MiniSingers choir run by Bristol Plays Music in the city centre.

Bristol Plays Music's South Bristol Music Centre is home to the Bristol Modern Orchestra (a mixed instrument, mixed genre project) and the Southside Choir which focuses on pop, rock, world and gospel music.

Areas of activity, interest and operation

09

Bristol Plays Music is also working closely with the South West Open Youth Orchestra to build inclusive ensemble opportunities for those with special needs or disabilities, particularly using custom-made digital instruments.

Action

Support and nurture large and small ensembles of all (and mixed) genres.

All children and young people should be able to access opportunities to develop their artistic excellence, regardless of background or circumstances and those facing the biggest barriers often require the most support. The use of new technologies and innovative approaches to music making has begun to demonstrate how many of these barriers are easily surmountable, provided that the learning environment is suitably equipped and that the workforce is both highly-skilled and representative of the diversity of the learners.

10.01 Additional and special educational needs and disabilities

No-one knows better than those directly involved that the categories of 'Special Educational Needs and Disability' and 'Cared-for Children' cover such a broad spectrum of people – and recognising the huge variations in needs, abilities and interests is critical in the work of the organisations that offer musical opportunities.

Bristol Plays Music's 'A New Ambition for Inclusive Excellence' is a three year project (funded in the main by the National Foundation for Youth Music) that brings together opportunities for young people with different needs in music by embracing and helping to develop the scope and work of organisations, such as OpenUp Music, already focusing on them.

Bristol-based OpenUp Music is an innovator in the field and their South West Open Youth Orchestra is set up to empower the young musicians to lead the ensemble, with no imposed aesthetic from the organisers. The Orchestra is building with members from small musical groups (Open School

Orchestras) that OpenUp Music work with in special schools in the area and has a strong emphasis on the development of techniques and equipment for those with restrictions on movement (such as eye-operated music software).

Drake Music established the Absorbed by Sound project as an open access drop-in session in which young people with particular needs can access and explore musical technology in secure areas at Colston Hall. They have accumulated a resource of such equipment stored in Henleaze. As with other providers in this area, Drake work in mainstream schools as well as designated special schools.

Several other providers such as Live Music Now and MiniBeats offer particular sessions to special needs groups and schools.

Through 'A New Ambition', Bristol Plays Music is also developing specific music opportunities for children in care, in liaison with the range of people and organisations formally engaged in this area, including The Hope virtual school and other providers in the youth services.

There are particular issues around increasing access for young people in these areas, which Bristol Plays Music and its partners clearly identify – some of which cut across many other areas within this review:

- These various projects are funded in the short term – but need to find long-term sustainability in order to develop and maximise their benefit.
- Physical access to premises is not always conducive.
- Special equipment and instruments are often needed – and these resources need to be developed and a stock accumulated.
- Affordable and available transport is generally needed to bring those with specific mobility needs to resourced and accessible spaces.

In pursuit of inclusion – a 'level playing field' – for young people with particular needs, there are other concerns that Bristol Plays Music and its partners in 'A New Ambition' are working to address. The music education workforce – music leaders, teachers, organisers – need the insight, skills and techniques to be able to work as effectively with young people with specific needs as with more conventionally able pupils.

Pathways of progression for these young musicians – including engagement with other kinds of music groups and tutors and mixed ability or inclusive ensembles – are not easy to find. And attitudes about their playing abilities and assessments of their achievement need to be more carefully considered – rather than the simplistic and possibly patronising appreciation that sometimes occurs for their ‘overcoming difficulties’.

Actions

Prioritise the pursuit of Inclusive Excellence inclusion through leadership by ‘A New Ambition’ and its partners.

Seek equal and permanent sustainable status for inclusive music-making by pursuing designation for Bristol as a DfE funded Centre for Advanced Training for special educational needs and disabilities.

Address the needs of this practice in workforce development, physical access and musical equipment.

10.02 Inclusion

Although they are of concern to all educators, the organisations in Bristol’s 3rd Space Music consortium (which comprises ACE CIC, Trinity, Basement Studio, Creative Youth Network and Knowle West Media Centre) have often given priority to those young people who are less engaged with formal education or in other ways are harder to reach or at risk. Whilst this is not their sole purpose, they have well-developed links with youth service providers and other agencies

and can provide safe and conducive environments in which young people can find opportunities to develop musical and personal skills.

The focus of these providers is musical – and often looks at aspects of the music business, and usually music from the indie/rock/urban spectrum. Their young musicians often come to them via referrals from other musicians and their peers but some also arrive by referral because of disaffection or issues that put them at risk such as homelessness, mental health or substance abuse.

A common approach amongst the 3rd Space Music providers is to focus on personal empowerment and development of the individual young person – in their skills, confidence, social relationships, as well as their musical progress.

Within scarce financial resources (often relying on short-term funding) and dedicated but limited personnel, these providers have considerable knowledge about their young musicians and ways of working with them – but there is insufficient collective data to be able to accurately identify a further range of people who might benefit from similar provision. Data on the demographics of class, ethnicity, gender and community – and their current music engagement – may exist in part across these organisations and the formal sector of schools and Hub, but are not consistent or comprehensive.

Addressing social inclusivity in music, as with special needs, requires a range of skills amongst music leaders and tutors that extend beyond musical training. Understanding psychological issues; skills such as conflict resolution; and insight into the particularities of different community groups and cultures – these are all

elements that are shared with some of the providers but need to be part of an inclusive training for the whole music education workforce.

Actions

Undertake consistent research into the demographics of inclusion and disengagement in order to identify other groups who could benefit from access to music-making.

Emphasise inclusive practice in workforce development by CPD and training for complementary skills.

10.03 Diversity

Bristol is a modern, multi-cultural city. It is estimated, for example, that within Knowle West Media Centre’s catchment area in south Bristol there are as many as thirty distinct cultural communities. Research indicates that as many as 21% of pupils in Bristol schools have first languages other than English – the highest such proportion in the South West.

Schools, the Hub and non-formal providers deal with young people from all communities and have an increasing need to understand them in terms of language and culture. Some non-formal organisations take on specific projects – for example with young people in refugee communities, engaged with by Creative Youth Network or by St George’s via the Lorraine Ayensu Refugee Arts (LARA) organisation.

Music can be a positive meeting place across cultures but, especially initially, young people like any other

age group will go to places where they feel comfortable. ACE CIC's open access evening sessions provide such a space at their St Paul's premises – in two separate sessions, one for 6 to 11 years olds and another for ages 11 to 16. The uptake for this mix of mentoring, individual exploration of music-making (in particular with digital technology) and listening to and sharing other music is, in the majority but not exclusively, by young black people from the area. The younger age sessions, interestingly, draw a wider ethnic mix.

As musicians who themselves were mentored and developed their skills as music leaders, the founders of ACE CIC provide support and whatever progression routes pathways they can for their attendees, including signposting the way to further and higher education courses.

The Asian Arts Agency, a national organisation supported by Arts Council England, undertakes some of its education work in Bristol, including projects on bhangra and masterclasses in Indian classical music. Together with ACE CIC and the African dance and drumming organization DMAC, Asian Arts are one of the three Bristol companies whose music leaders are from the diverse communities that they represent.

Diversity in the music workforce is another element that can help broaden the reach of music education into other communities. As well as simple representation, this diversity will also help with insights into and understanding of Bristol's different communities in order to offer appropriate musical activity or the circumstances in which it takes place. The Somali and some other Muslim communities, for example, embrace cultural attitudes to, for example,

music-making and gender education, that are not widely understood by music educators and therefore inhibit the offer of appropriate opportunities for their young people.

Actions

Encourage and develop diversity in the workforce.

Continue to seek understanding of cultural attitudes and their relation to music and music-making environments.

10.04 Direction overall

The essential aim for all providers of music-making and music education for young people – whatever the needs, background or circumstances of any of those young people might be – must be to remove barriers and inhibitions and make access and achievement available to all. And rather than view this aim in terms of actions that remove or negate problems, it is far better to suggest a wholly positive approach: to adopt a set of principles, approaches and methods within all activity that, from the outset, allow every person to take part in whatever they wish.

Action

Ensure that environments and ways of working are founded upon principles that will allow fully inclusive provision for all young musicians.

When young people are encouraged to be more active in their learning, they are more likely to feel empowered and progression is tangibly improved. A creative learning environment which provides opportunities to showcase talent, gain industry experience, connect with the local music scene, and which makes explicit links between school, college, university, and industry activity is more likely to enable aspiring music professionals to plot their own course and reach their full potential.

11.01 Youth voice, musical minds

Bristol Plays Music's long-standing project partnership with Sound Connections (and the latter's youth-led Wired4Sound) – the 'Musical Minds: Have Your Say' consultation – has exemplified the Hub's determination to put young musicians and their interests at the heart of its work. Along with many of the other providers already mentioned (such as the Creative Youth Network who also empower young people in decision making) the Hub's aim has been to focus on the development of the individual young person, in this case by bringing groups of young musicians – in the age group 16 to 25) together to hear their views on what matters to them in their musical journey.

In one way the message coming from the musicians has been simple: "let's move from consultation to action". Young people are pleased to be consulted but want to be doing something and making their own networks and musical community. Their final consultation 'wish list' has been summarised as:

- Networking: online and/or face to face, to meet with other artists, producers, promoters and like-minded people from across Bristol.
- Safe spaces: with supportive and knowledgeable staff; where mentoring on a 1:1 basis could take place alongside the opportunity to gain advice and guidance from industry professionals.
- Opportunities: to have a say, take a lead or produce events and projects, with an emphasis on enterprise and professional development.

The Musical Minds consultation has drawn on the interest of active young musicians, mainly from the indie/rock/urban sector and the participants in 3rd Space Music projects. Much of the demand they have expressed in detail focusses on mentoring and training in music industry career skills – e.g. stage presence, PR, publishing, work experience in the music business etc – which suggests that there may be other groups of musicians who would have a different perspective according to the kind of musical activity in which they are involved. It is also reasonable to assume that other age groups might have different perspectives on what they want and need from music-making.

What the initial consultation proved, however, was that best practice amongst providers is endorsed by their young musicians. These elements include the opportunity for musicians to follow self-determined paths (within a structured programme); the value of peer-to-peer mentoring; inclusion of advice and mentoring from professionals and hands on experience; and joint performance opportunities.

It also proves the importance of providers resisting the temptation to be 'territorial' or possessive of the young people on their programmes: thinking of where a musician needed to be in their best interest rather than seeing them as 'ours' and perhaps inhibiting them from moving on.

It also indicates that young musicians, with support from providers but freedom to find their own perspective, will be essential as contributors to future planning and persuasive 'ambassadors' in advocating for the benefits and opportunities of music education.

Actions

As a first principle, place the young musician at the centre of the work.

Take note of the Music Minds conclusions and recommendations, in particular:

Incorporate a youth-centred perspective in all staff induction.

Ensure that a youth-centred perspective is a clear part of the organisation's values.

Factor capacity and resource for youth-centred, youth-led activity into budgets and fundraising.

Ensure the voices of young people are heard from – across various age groups and across the full range of music and musicians – and responded to appropriately.

Enable existing youth networks across the city to connect with one another.

can undertake section coaching for their opposite numbers in the Bristol Youth Orchestra.

Regular high level coaching is available through the Bristol Centre for Young Musicians – a Bristol Plays Music partnership with Bristol Cathedral Choir School and the Guildhall School of Music & Drama using facilities at Bristol Cathedral Choir School. Regular sessions with visiting professionals are complemented by coaching from Guildhall students.

The independently run Bristol Pre-Conservatoire school offers high level coaching for advanced young musicians in jazz, classical and small ensemble work.

Action

Continue to support and encourage the highest level of interaction between young musicians and professional musicians, coaches and mentors.

Each project defines its own coverage of industry issues and most feature professionals from the industry as tutors or session leaders at some point. The list of topics covered is a long one, which can be summarised as:

Industry insights into social media, online platforms, labels, publishing, PR, image, marketing, studio and production, booking, stagecraft, songwriting and business development. To these may be added the contingent skills of film and video, photography and design.

Bristol-based providers – e.g. Knowle West Media Centre and Trinity – have links for their young people with further education course providers such as Access To Music.

Autonomy and enterprise are attractive elements in programmes such as those run by Creative Youth Network. Young musicians manage a record label – Temple Records – via a steering group of 16 to 25-years olds, selecting and signing artists and setting out a programme of support from recording to release and sales.

As well as this kind of peer support and mentoring, young people seek direct experience working alongside professionals in the music sector. This is harder to attain and relationships between the full-scale industry and youth sector organisations are an area that most of the providers suggest need to be better developed. There have, however, been some good examples, including opportunities in liaison with the BBC.

In preparing people for a career in music, the emphasis by providers is likely to be on the reality for most musicians of a portfolio of work – playing, teaching, producing etc – rather than the occasional opportunity for stardom. They also see training and education in music as

11.02 Coaching and experience with professionals

Concert halls – and other performance venues like Trinity – are able to bring visiting performing artists together with young musicians whenever possible, for masterclass sessions or even 'meet and greet/ Q&A'. Project mentoring in some programmes will be by professional performers, songwriters, producers etc.

More extended contact and coaching from professionals is also organized with players from visiting orchestras. Both the London Symphony Orchestra and the Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra, whilst visiting Colston Hall,

11.03 Music business and career employment

As the review shows, there is a range of opportunities for young musicians interested in the music industry in its various aspects and in music as a career. Aside from the training directed at potential conservatoire students, the 3rd Space Music organisations all have industry elements in their programmes.

In addition Bristol Plays Music hosts short-course or summer-school programmes in partnership with national providers – including Frequencies with Youth and Music and the Urban Artist Summer School with Urban Development.

an aid to employability in any other field of work, given the importance of creativity and discipline that a good musician must learn.

It is often the case that families and others concerned with a young person's future do not have insights into the music industry and what a career might entail. There may be opportunities to help aspiring musicians with information and insights for their families about career prospects.

Actions

Continue to develop relationships with the music industry for guidance and work experience opportunities.

Encourage and increase links with further and higher education.

Assist the families of young musicians to understand the scope and potential of a career in music.

11.4 Accreditation

Within several programmes young musicians (from 11 years upwards) can choose to work for Arts Awards credits. Optional and through three stages of achievement (Bronze, Silver and Gold) the process is self-motivated and helps to build a portfolio of work and achieve standards equivalent to GCSE and A levels. Arts Award providers include Creative Youth Network and their partners at the Station and St George's.

St George's is also designated by the Children's University as a Learning.

In the preceding section this review gives a flavour of the admirable scale and scope of available opportunities for young musicians (or potential musicians) in the city – whilst also indicating directions for the future to build on these achievements.

In the course of the various consultations, issues and ideas have emerged that have a general relevance across the sector, and which also indicate achievements and future potential.

12.1 Research

This review has gathered a great deal of information and ideas from across the sector – but it has not been a mapping or auditing exercise. Organisers have a range of evaluative and statistical information about their work and the young people they work with. Accumulated and analysed, this information might provide other indications for future directions or evidence upon which to build programmes. Where data is collected, some agreement on standard and consistent methodologies would enable organisations to share and combine their findings.

In cultural communities or particular groups of young people where take up of music opportunities is anecdotally more limited – and here issues of inclusivity and diversity are distinctly highlighted – focused auditing and research would give providers more accurate insight to where the specific gaps lay and into appropriate ways in which to address them.

The Musical Minds consultation has been a successful process of ‘action research’ – and suggests the value of ongoing research into the needs and inclinations of young musicians,

including their requirements for signposting and referrals. A consistent accumulation of case studies tracking young people’s progress and pathways would be equally instructive.

Outputs, outcomes and measurements of the results of programmes and activities are notoriously difficult to judge or benchmark given the diversity of activity and interest in the sector. Where such information is being gathered – or is required by funders and other agencies – there would be value in some kind of consistency of approach that providers could share.

In terms of advocacy for the sector as a whole, a full audit of all music education and youth music in Bristol would undoubtedly provide strong arguments for support.

Research and mapping exercises are most usefully carried out by specialists: with their commitment to music education the universities of Bristol and the West of England might provide these skills.

Actions

Prioritise research into issues of diversity and inclusion.

Collaborate to build consistently comparable and practically useful data.

Cont...

...Continue action research into the interests and progression of young musicians.

Consider the engagement or appointment of a researcher(s) to conduct ongoing research and identify areas of work and communities to approach with new opportunities.

12.2 Pathways

Progression routes, or pathways, along which young musicians can travel to follow their skills and interests in music are not necessarily vertical but may vary in direction according to those interests. Progression for many people is not purely about achievement – but about individual interests, needs, satisfaction.

Throughout this review a number of music leaders, organisers and young musicians have suggested that whilst there are routes and next steps to which they can refer or be referred, a comprehensive ‘map’ and information on other programmes and (appropriate) opportunities is not immediately available.

Bristol Plays Music’s website is brimming with information on programmes and projects – and each of the music centres and non-formal providers have their own referral contacts. Between them the

organisations in the 3rd Space Music consortium have been able to create a more organic set of contacts and referrals for those musicians they are dealing with, so the picture is well underway in that area of activity. But not enough people have the full picture. Ironically it may be the unusually rich and diversified array of providers and programmes in Bristol that account for this lack of comprehensive information. The next step may be to draw together details – perhaps available via an online resource – of the styles, approaches and overall aims of each provider and project so that teachers and music leaders can help their musicians navigate more confidently towards connections that are right for them.

In terms of school progression, the Hub has in place transition reports for children from primary to secondary schools. Within the school music plans would it also be possible for Hub staff to guide teachers toward the range of out-of-school and non-formal sector programmes that might best suit some of their pupils?

Initial referrals to non-formal providers come from many sides and from outside of the music sector – from youth service and health agencies for example. Can providers collectively develop a simple signposting system to assist these agencies and their young people to find the most appropriate place to begin? Is there a similar need to help guide parents and families and the young musicians themselves?

If the information as described could be brought together, it might also serve to inform various organisers about where they could find – or, if not available, might want to build – links with other programmes to aid progression for their musicians.

Actions

Accumulate and map comprehensive information on a range of appropriate pathways and referrals

Seek to address whatever gaps may be apparent in those pathways, including routes into the industry

12.3 Information and communication

The issues of research and pathways are both concerned with collection and dissemination of information and can be interlinked. But there are other channels of communication that are currently providing information of various kinds.

Bristol Plays Music's website is packed with necessary information about their own and related projects and the Bristol Plays Music monthly newsletter is similarly extensive. Almost all the providers have websites with varying amounts of information and their own email lists. St George's, for instance, also produce their own schools newsletter.

Regular communication and the constant gathering and updating of information is a labour-intensive and time-consuming activity and, of necessity, the prodigious amount of information to be circulated is often bundled together although parts of it may only be applicable to different target groups. So, for instance, an item about CPD courses for music teachers may be in the same news file as an appeal for funding donations or an encouragement for young musicians to take up a specific performance opportunity. Ideally, the store of

information and communication activities across the sector could be broken down in terms of the kinds of information and the various targets, e.g.:

- Advocacy – the messages about music education in Bristol. Opportunities are needed to get messages out to Bristol and further afield, to touch and hopefully influence those not directly involved in the musical structures and environments and to raise the profile of musical opportunities
- 'Trade' information – for teachers, leaders, organisers – including such things as insights into current funding trends, changes in public policy, training and CPD opportunities, network events, exchanging ideas.
- Directory and contact information – for parents, carers, outside agencies, young people and also sector providers, with basic details of individuals and organisations in Bristol and what they offer
- Youth music networking information, ideas, information and opportunities for and by young musicians themselves.

Although this, or variations of it, might be the ideal, the realities are that much of the information overlaps and no single organisation has the capacity to co-ordinate such an extensive communication spectrum. But through discussion and collaboration, further progress may be possible.

Action

Work together to find effective ways of collectively collecting and disseminating information and communicating with the target groups, to avoid duplication of effort

12.4 Relationships, partnerships, consortia

So many of the programmes and projects for youth music across (and beyond) Bristol are run as, or involve, partnerships between two or more providers – and almost all providers also have a set of occasional or informal relationships with others. Charting them all – and the complex web that they weave between one another – would be as time consuming and detailed as researching a prolific artist's discography.

Organisations appreciate the 'collective impact' approach. The value of various partnerships is to enhance and extend the opportunities available to young musicians and they are created with that aim in view, on the basis of compatibility and mutual ambitions between providers. The profusion and diversity of Bristol's scene for youth music make relationship forming and partnership working the more possible and there is no set formula that each should follow, nor is there an imperative to form partnerships for their own sake.

However, this review indicates three main points in terms of partnership work: the role of the Hub; the strength and potential of appropriate consortia; and areas where more partnership, consortia and collective work may be of use.

The Hub system was devised to try and bring together the various strands of youth music and music education available in each local authority, in both formal and non-formal sectors. Bristol Plays Music has achieved more than most Hubs in making so many new links and partnerships and supporting those that already existed: between

the school sector and non-formal sector organisations, such as with the Bristol Ensemble and the schools adopting the Preludes immersive project; with organisations from outside Bristol that have something else to add to the mix – e.g. with Urban Development for the Urban Artist course or the London Symphony Orchestra; and as a co-ordinating partner for newly-formed consortia on different focal areas – 3rd Space Music and 'A New Ambition for Inclusive Excellence'.

As an example of the latter, the 3rd Space Music consortium members are clear that the added-value that they now offer in terms of collective activity and referrals for their young musicians has come about through a fairly lengthy process of exploring just how to work together, with the Hub not leading but co-ordinating as an equal partner. Patience and the steady resolve to build mutual understanding and personal relationships has paid off – recognising the strengths and abilities of one another in the course of that process has resulted in the development of a strong consortium programme in which resources can be shared and territorial tendencies put aside.

Aside from partnership working 'A New Ambition', for example, underlines the possibilities of fundraising for collective activity on a large scale.

Consortia – or more extended relationships – may not always be the key to better provision for young musicians – and the need to be generated by providers themselves, not imposed from outside or above – but they might be explored in certain areas. The Guildhall School of Music is collaborating with the Bristol Centre for Young Musicians working with highly talented instrumentalists. Would there be benefits in exploring

further more structured liaison with, for example, Bristol Pre-Conservatoire, the Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra and London Symphony Orchestra or Tomorrow's Warriors? At the other age extreme, is there a reason for early years and primary first-access providers (formal and non-formal) to group together to achieve more coverage?

Collective liaison or action, rather than actual consortia, might also be of use in terms of links with organisations and agencies outside of Bristol or outside of youth music, such as (as notional examples) Royal Welsh College of Music, National Youth Jazz Collective, the youth service, headteachers' associations, arts council officers, Musicians' Union, broadcasters etc.

Similarly, would there be benefit in collective sharing of information and advice around regulatory obligations – for example DBS checks and safeguarding policies?

Actions

Continue to develop consortia and collaborations for 3rd Space Music and 'A New Ambition'

Encourage other possible groupings (for example Early Years?) to consider exploring the development of consortia that may add value to the sum of individual activities

12.5 Networking

Primary and secondary music teachers now meet in their own (separate) networks, enabled by Bristol Plays Music. They have the opportunity to liaise with the Hub's services and share ideas, experiences, information etc.

Consortia and partnerships obviously meet and some tap into networks outside Bristol or youth music. But whilst there have been wider consultative meetings at the outset of this review process – and prior to (and early on in) the establishment of the Hub a Bristol Music Education Partnership had been convened – there is not currently a network or meeting structure that encompasses all those active in the sector as providers, teachers or music leaders.

This review discovered a clear consensus – almost everyone consulted agreed that a regular networking meeting – perhaps once or twice a year – would be of substantial benefit. It would serve for exchanging ideas and information, making new contacts and renewing others, hearing about other areas of work and research in the sector from Bristol and further afield – and providing the stimulus for collective discussion of issues, plans and actions to continue to raise the standards of what can be achieved for Bristol's young musicians.

Several issues were raised that would need to be addressed to make a network/conference a success: Who would lead and administer it? Who would set the agenda and the programme? It must be comprehensive, so schools and teachers should be as involved as non-formal sector music leaders. When and where should it be held?

Finding the right *modus operandi* for a network event would need to encompass answers to these and other questions – but the interest is clearly there to begin.

Action

Plan, shape and inaugurate a regular networking event to reach the widest groups of professional practitioners and organisations

12.6 The workforce

Across the wide spectrum of music education and youth music provision – in the formal school sector and the informal sector's independent organisations – there is an equally wide spectrum of teachers, tutors, mentors and administrators. Work patterns and hours of work and other working conditions are of course very varied according to the various kinds of activity.

As with the sector in general, there is no collected data on the full extent of the numbers of providers and the scope of their work, although the Hub holds information on the tutors and teaching sessions that they provide directly. If the full range of information on provision and providers could be identified and quantified as part of a future research programme, it is likely that the volume of people involved and hours of activity delivered would give the sector significant material for advocacy.

The sector also relies on the work of willing volunteers – parents and others committed to the value of music and education, helping to run workshops, youth ensembles and choirs, concerts and the governing bodies of many of the organisations involved. These numbers are also unquantified but

are essential to the viable operation of much of the community, arts, education and not-for-profit based work of the sector.

In the course of this review consultees have constantly emphasised the value not only of the skilled work and time of the youth music workforce, both paid and voluntary, but also of the high level of sheer commitment and service they give to supporting young musicians. Given the financial and many other pressures that the music leaders and educators have to deal with in order to make their activity happen – aside from the actual musical work – they are to be complimented and encouraged at every opportunity. The old dictum was never truer than in youth music work: "no one is in this for the money..."

Music leaders also agree that opportunities to meet one another and share ideas and experiences (as well as more extensive sharing of working practices) are beneficial not only to their individual work but to a positive sense of collective action and the reaffirmation of the value of their commitment. Networking and partnership events, along with CPD and training, are elements of this review that can support and encourage music leaders in this way.

12.7 Training in higher education

Both universities in Bristol contribute not only to training future teachers and musicians but to work in the city's youth music sector. The University of the West of England (UWE) is collaborating with Bristol Plays Music in (amongst other things) the development of a BA in Music focussing on music education.

The University of Bristol's Graduate School of Education and the leaders

of their PGCE course in music have undertaken research into music teaching in the city for Bristol Plays Music and trainee teachers on the course are involved in practical activities such as the primary orchestral days.

12.8 CPD, training, workforce development

One of the Hub's set roles is to provide CPD for teachers within the formal education sector. Building this programme of over 25 events per annum has also enabled Bristol Plays Music to extend the CPD opportunities to peripatetic music tutors and music leaders/practitioners across the non-formal sector. Although there is no requirement for CPD activity to be formally recognised, Bristol

Plays Music has ensured that all of its CPD packages are put through the necessary certification process, ensuring an appropriate level of quality and content.

A training course is being introduced – leading to a Certificate for Music Educators – that is designed to support musicians and leaders who may be working at present without a formal teaching qualification.

For non-music-specialist teachers in primary schools the CPD process includes the rolling out of Bristol Plays Music's Curriculum for Music and the developing use of the Minute of Listening package in collaboration with Sound and Music.

Aside from these and other specifics of teaching techniques and materials, Bristol Plays Music's CPD programme has also begun to address wider issues of the kind outlined in this review. In relation to the approaches embodied in the 'A New Ambition' programme, a

CPD strand – The Inclusive Practitioner – is designed to work with teachers and music leaders on an approach that takes full account of the differing abilities and capacities of young people and deals with all young musicians in an inclusive, rather than separatist, manner.

There is an appetite in both the formal and non-formal sectors for CPD and training – despite the limitations that timetable, workload and budget sometimes impose. There is also an appetite for the extension of the content to address some of the wider issues that music leaders may encounter with young people and the knowledge and skills that are needed to meet them. These include, for instance, an understanding of people with conditions such as ADHD, anxiety or depression; or the circumstances of young people at risk in terms of homelessness, or substance abuse.

CPD could mirror training of the kind that a youth worker might have – to deal with these kinds of issues and acquire skills such as conflict resolution. It could also look to other disciplines – not just in the arts but in, for example, sports education, to explore any useful comparative approaches.

As mentioned elsewhere in this review, issues of diversity are important areas of concern for schools as well as the non-formal, especially given the changing composition of local populations and catchment areas. There is a clear need for CPD which will give insights and better understanding of different cultural communities and their attitudes to and/or needs in music.

Whilst issues of inclusion and diversity are important for the teachers and leaders, they are also an issue in terms of the composition of the workforce. The incidence of disabled music

leaders in Bristol is low. So, to an extent, is the incidence of leaders from BME and other minority communities. Over time, the broadening of the workforce is an important aim endorsed across the sector.

The other element of workforce development – recognised by the Musical Minds initiative and already put into practice by the Bristol Music Trust – is embedding the principles and understandings of working with young people across the rest of a workforce which doesn't necessarily deal directly with them. Bristol Music Trust, for example, has involved such ideas in wider staff training sessions.

Actions

Support and nurture the workforce and advocate the value and impact of their collective activity.

Continue to broaden the scope of CPD and training to encompass musical and non-musical skills and inclusive practice.

Follow a policy of broadening the diversity of the workforce.

Learn from good examples of CPD as practised in other markedly diverse communities in the UK.

12.9 Geography, travel, transport

The City of Bristol local authority spreads out over a very wide area and for some children and young people – and their parents and carers – there may be barriers of cost and transport links which inhibit them from reaching particular music destinations. Several of the providers – including

Bristol Music Trust's Colston Hall itself – are in central locations but Bristol Plays Music's music centres, although each has a different musical emphasis, cover much of the council's territory. Some of the non-formal providers take their activity out across the area but equipment and resources are based in their central premises.

Knowle West Media Centre is an exception in its location but it still finds it necessary to assist some XLR participants to travel into its premises by helping them with taxi fares (drawn from its project funds).

It is important to note that young people with particular needs of care or mobility will always require more extensive transport arrangements, wherever their music sessions are located.

Although Bristol's transport links are well outside the remit or competence of this review, it appears that the new MetroBus may help a little with some travel-to-music issues. Whether an idea mooted during the consultation – the acquisition and operation of a 'music bus' dedicated to ferrying young players around the city – is a possibility, is a subject, perhaps, for further consideration.

Action

Explore options for overcoming the barriers to access for young musicians of travel and transport.

12.10 Resources

Over a long period Bristol organisers – such as the 3rd Space Music members – have done well in acquiring and accumulating instruments, back-line, DJing and recording equipment and digital music technology, for use on their premises. Bristol Plays

Music have a full range of hundreds of instruments on loan to schools for whole class teaching, to pupils for individual practise, to looked after children taking up playing and to those young musicians who need particular expensive or difficult to obtain instruments such as bassoon or double bass.

Drake Music has a stock of customised instruments and equipment that can be brought into use for those with physical or other special needs. OpenUp Music indicates that to be fully inclusive there is a need to be able to devise, invent and make music-making equipment and instruments that give particular access to particular music makers according to their condition.

Bristol Plays Music has digital technology equipment in the Colston Hall for its work in and out of schools with the Conductive Music, Beat Lab and tablet-based, primary age Touch programmes. ACE CIC confirms that the use of their digital equipment is an increasingly important and fast route to engaging young people in initial music making and experimentation thereafter.

There is no complete audit or database of what is available across the city but most providers will be aware of what kit can be found and where. The most important point is that renewal and accumulation of instruments and equipment is vital if the range and scope of current activity is to be maintained, let alone increased.

Action

Make allowances in operating and project budgets and fundraising for the acquisition, sharing and renewal of resources, instruments and equipment

12.11 Finance, fundraising

There is no bigger issue in the arts, in the public sector, in education and in the not-for-profit third sector than securing funds and sustaining programmes of work. It is not possible here to analyse the financial situation for youth music and music education in Bristol in such a multifarious pattern of providers, or to sum it up in simple terms (except to say that everyone would like to have more cash and flexible budgets!). This review can, however, point to the unsurprising list of issues that recurred most often during the consultations.

Bristol City Council, despite the burden of costs and cuts that they are required to bear as a local authority, give valuable support to a whole range of arts, music and youth organisations – an essential underpinning of provision.

Where organisations are also regularly core funded (as national portfolio organisations) by Arts Council England – as are Bristol Music Trust with St George's, Asian Arts Agency and Knowle West Media Centre – they have some degree of additional stability. And the Arts Council England Hub funding is the basis for a lot of Bristol Plays Music's core work.

Organisations with a wider brief, such as Creative Youth Network, may be funded or contracted as an outsourced provider – for a range of youth work in which music is included. Some can earn a part of their income by hiring out space or equipment, or, like ACE CIC, providing contracted services to supplement their funded music work.

But every organisation still needs to raise other funds and earn income to support the range and extent of its programmes. A few have the staffing

capacity to employ fundraisers – which usually also means that their income targets and needs are also much higher – but the majority of the youth music providers have to work on fundraising alongside the co-ordination of their music activities. Some, like ACE CIC, do not have fulltime staff even for their core work.

Schools, each managing their own budget, have widely varying allocations for music, which impacts on the extent of the services they can secure from the Hub as well as the kind of projects they may want to contract in from non-formal sector providers. By the same token, each of the providers have to make individual approaches and negotiations with schools rather than assuming a standard pattern.

At the time of writing there are indications that under severe financial pressures some schools may have to cut arts and music budgets drastically or possibly altogether. In these cases (and in general) there is a need to advocate consistently for the value and positive impact of music and the arts in education and personal development.

The Hub's charges across all its activities to schools and for music centre sessions are modest – and some activities are offered free of charge or with bursaries, to give access to those unable to meet the cost – all of which is subsidised by the core grant from Arts Council England. The Hub 'passport' giving a young person access to all Bristol Plays Music out-of-school activities for two terms for a flat fee of £75 is a particularly attractive proposition.

But major new initiatives such as 'A New Ambition' can only be supported by high levels of fundraising from agencies such as the National Foundation for Youth Music.

The range of potential funding sources for various kinds of music work is wide – incorporating everything from local trust funds to European Union schemes (although the latter must now be in doubt) but the competition for grants is increasingly severe as public sector sources continue to diminish or are withdrawn.

Bursaries, free places, minimal fees – all methods of improving access for young musicians from low income backgrounds are in play in some form in Bristol as elsewhere – but there is no overall pattern or system or rationale apart from the generosity of the providers and their ability to make the budgets balance.

The project-funded nature of so much of the work of the organisations covered by this review is a real threat to sustainability and development. Almost all project funding is short-term – lasting two or three years at the very most – and the schemes and criteria of project funding agencies change regularly, very often looking for new or different approaches to fund and thus often inhibiting applications for the simple continuation of a successful project. As a consequence, organisations with one clear aim and purpose or a core programme that they would prefer to continue will often have to change their direction or distort their focus in order to at least continue to do music work.

To an extent this situation has become the norm – but nevertheless it is a constant threat to long-term sustainability and growth in the sector.

Looking across the wealth of activity in Bristol, the financial investment in youth music work is undoubtedly substantial. There is no overall audit or totalling of the turnover and financial value of the work – but this might be a useful piece of research. The results could be used

in advocacy – or some potential might emerge for collective fundraising using some (or all?) of the figures as a match for funding being sought.

Actions

Advocate, where possible, for longer-term and more sustainable funding for ongoing programmes of work.

Explore the potential or viability of a Bristol-wide, sustainable bursary or support fund.

Explore opportunities for collective fundraising or income generation.

Seek research and advocacy opportunities around the value of investment in youth music and music education in Bristol.

Advocate for arts and music education in schools.

12.12 Venues, promoters

The valuable links between performance venues and promoters and schools and all manner of other youth music projects have appeared in various contexts in this review. Masterclasses, coaching and meeting with visiting artists; the chance for young choirs, ensembles and bands to perform on concert hall or festival stages; venues hosting choirs and ensembles in residence; and venues running their own educational programmes both as outreach or in the venue itself – every instance is a welcome opportunity and Bristol provides many of them.

In order to capitalise on these relationships with younger generation musicians, and attract them to the

venues and festivals as audiences as well as performers and pupils, some of the practises currently in place could successfully be extended. One is to extend the planning times for connecting performance programmes with educational activity of the kind described above. Although not always possible, having discussions with performers as early as possible in advance may maximise the opportunity for their working with young musicians when the concert day arrives.

Secondly, within the realistic potential of the city's performance venues and promoters, could more promoters be encouraged to engage with education providers?

Bristol's young musicians are the musical opinion formers and leaders of the future, so is it possible to extend the practise of some promoters and devise some kind of wider scheme to attract more young musicians as audiences to concert and gigs so that they can experience the widest range of live music for themselves?

As the home of Bristol Plays Music, Bristol Music Trust is undertaking a major redevelopment of Bristol's – the west of England's – biggest concert hall. More than just a rebuilding project, it is projected to be a transformation – and placing young musicians and youth music work at the heart of the new facilities promises to be a genuinely transforming sign of the city's commitment.

As well as the larger, funded venues, Bristol also has a network of small-scale venues that host all manner of performances and are an essential part of the city's musical ecology. In order to nurture and maintain plentiful opportunities for young musicians to hear (and play) a wide range of music, it is also important that this full range of venues is valued and supported across the city.

Actions

Continue and encourage further engagement by promoters and venues with education and young musicians.

Support and encourage Bristol Music Trust in their transformation to a state of the art facility and an organisation centred on music and young musicians.

2.13 Exporting Bristol's knowledge and skills

As the review shows, and in contrast to many areas of England, Bristol is home to an unusually extensive pool of musicians and organisations with skills and experience in education and youth music. The Hub, and alongside the Hub, its partners and collaborative projects, have been recognised regionally and nationally as being amongst the front runners in their field of work.

In their different ways, projects such as Preludes, 'A New Ambition for Inclusive Excellence' and 3rd Space Music are exploring and testing fresh ways of working and good practice. Several Bristol organisations are already collaborating on a regional or national level – or providing services in other localities.

Without taking their eye off the Bristol ball, it would seem possible for the city's providers to find ways to capitalise on their strengths – on the concentration of expertise in the city and adventurous projects – and look for ways to export some of those skills to other areas that have fewer people or organisational resources to call upon locally.

Bristol has the opportunity to consolidate its place as a field leader and a centre of good and diverse practice. It would require further advocacy; careful assurance of the validity of what was being offered out; the use of the kinds of information or directory described elsewhere in this review; and careful collaborative management to ensure that it was not weakening or disenfranchising any of the city's partner organisations. But it might be a fitting ambition.

Action

Within the sector's network, and with other appropriate agencies for the development of skills and opportunities for Bristol, explore the idea of collaborative promotion of Bristol skills and provision further afield.

The prospect for young musicians in Bristol is fundamentally good – and providers of all kinds of activity, whether in schools or in non-formal settings, are to be congratulated on what has been achieved to date.

Several of the non-formal sector organisations are well-established leaders in their field. Bristol Plays Music is recognised as one of England’s most progressive Music Education Hubs, and the only one with the immense advantage of being based in a concert hall and promoting organisation devoted to every aspect of music.

This review does not disguise the fact that there are gaps in what is happening and therefore there are young people who don’t have the level of access to music making to which everyone in Bristol would aspire. But those aspirations are plainly shared by the contributors to this review and so is the will to extend and improve access to music for as many young musicians as possible.

The external challenges that music education and promotion faces are common to most organisers across the third and public sectors: financial constraints, constant change, schools struggling to maintain basic offers in several important subjects, disparities among communities, social and personal hardship – and many other aspects of contemporary life. But once again, people in Bristol are committed to meet such challenges through – and for – music.

This review and the actions it indicates are presented at a point in time. The situation of the sector is constantly evolving as creative new ideas are brought into play. Initiatives such as the all-female Saffron Record label or new partnerships with the University of the West of England will open new doors for young musicians and their mentors.

The review and the action points, therefore, cannot just be adopted and remain static. To maintain a current picture of what’s happening and what needs to be done, there must be regular re-examination of the areas the review describes, revising and updating the action points to keep them focussed on the work in hand.

The work in hand and the actions to support it present a long and varied list. There are many common themes – and there are these overriding imperatives which may serve to summarise them all:

Bristol will focus on supporting all its young musicians in whatever ways they wish and in whatever part of their musical journey.

Bristol’s organisations and music leaders will form strong partnerships, with those who are able taking their fair share of the responsibility – and will commit to forging effective, co-ordinated responses to support music education across the full spectrum of the city’s schools and communities.

Strategic partners

In the course of developing this review the wide range of people and organisations listed below were contacted over an extended period. Bristol Plays Music thanks all of those who responded and offered the wealth of ideas and information on which this review and its directions for the future have been built.

Access to Music	Cotham School	Tom Fleming Creative Consultancy
ACE CIC	Creative Youth Network	Tomorrows Warriors
Arts Council England	DbS Music	Trinity Arts
Asian Arts Agency	Drake Music	University of the West of England
Bards of Avalon	Gathering Voices	Urban Development
Basement Studios	Knowle West Media Centre	Visible Thinking
Bath Philharmonia	Live Music Now	Watershed
B-Creative	London Symphony Orchestra	WOMAD Foundation
BIMM	Muse	Young Bristol
Bristol Music Education Partnership	Musica	
Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra	National Foundation for Youth Music	
Bris Arts	New Music South West	
Bristol Cathedral Choir School	Open Up Music	
Bristol City Council	Princes Trust	
Bristol Cultural Education Partnership	Real Ideas Organisation	
Bristol Ensemble	Redland Green School	
Bristol Jazz and Blues Festival	Saffron Records	
Bristol Music School	Somerset Rural Youth Project	
Bristol Music Trust team	Sound and Music	
Bristol Old Vic	Sound Connections	
Bristol Plays Music team	Soundworks	
Bristol Pre Conservatoire	South West Music Schools	
Bristol Rock Centre	Spike Island	
Bristol University	St Mary Redcliffe	
Bristol Young Vic	St. Georges, Bristol	
Bristol Youth Links	Studio 7	
Cabot Learning Federation	Superact	

Commissioned by

